AJOLD

African Journal of Leadership and Development

2019, Vol. 4 No. 1, 1-15

DOI: https://doi.org/10.63990/2019ajoldvol4iss1pp1-15

Challenges and Opportunities of Public Service Delivery in Bole Sub City: The Case of Trade and Industry Sector

Degusew Tessema [1]

Abstract

The purpose of the study was to assess the challenges and opportunities of public service delivery in Bole Sub City Trade and Industry sector. To meet the objective of the study, descriptive survey method was employed. To gather the necessary data, questionnaire and interviews were the main instruments employed. The results obtained from the study revealed that majority of the employees are clear about their organization's mission, vision and shared values. Moreover, most leaders supporting their employees and give on time solution to customers' complaints. Reform tools such as BSC and Change Army were found to have positive contribution in delivering service. Service standards are set by the sector and most customers have knowledge about it. However, there is a limitation in continuously improving service standards by the sector. Furthermore, lack of capacity building trainings, skill and attitude gaps on employees, shortages of human resource, budget, office furniture, high employee turnover, unfavorable working environment, electric power and interruption and network accessibility are the major challenge of service delivery in sector. Increasing number of customers from time to time in connection with the expansion of the sub city is another factor for not delivering services based on service standards set. Based on the findings and the conclusions it is recommended that the sector needs to build employee capacity, establish motivation system, and alleviate the shortage of human power, budget, office furniture, high employee turnover and unfavorable organizational environment. Besides, it needs to communicate further about standards and the requirements of service, and the office alignment need to be reorganized.

Key Words: Service, Service delivery, Service standard, service requirements and Reform tools.

1. Introduction

It is widely accepted that organizations of these days are confronting a very tough and complex business world. The pace of change is increasing at an alarming rate. In relation to this fact, Belete (2001:4) assures that any organization regardless of its size or natural existence has been facing challenging business environment that can determine its existence, success or failure.

In the past, customers have no choices to buy services or products and there is no access to information. In other words, sellers or service providers had more power than customers in

[1] Center for Policy, Leadership and Human Resource Training and Consultancy,
Ethiopian Civil Service University, Email: degutesema@yahoo.com

ISSN 2519-5255(print) ISSN 2957-9104(online)

This is an open access article licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

deciding the price, quality, and quantity and cycle time for delivering the services or the products.

In contrast, the scenario of today's business is very different from that of the past. Various factors contributed for this paradigm shift. Globalization and the development of ICT made the world a small village so that the customer can buy anything regardless of distance. In agreement with this reality, Harvard Business essentials (2003:8) revealed that organizations typically respond to the challenges of new technologies, new competitors, new markets, and demands for greater performance with various programs, each designed to overcome obstacles and enhance business performance.

Because of these reasons, the dominant force in the customer-seller relationship shifted from seller to customer side (Hammer and Champy, 1993:18). That is, the customer has a power in deciding the price and the quality of service rendering. Customers now tell suppliers what they want, when they want it, how they want it, and what they will pay (ibid, 18). This leads to a fierce competition among organizations than ever. Hence, to be successful in this dynamic business environment, organizations are obliged to consider the needs of their customers (Milakovich, 1995:5). Due to these facts, public service providers have to plan to deliver outstanding services or products by improving the quality, with reasonable price and with minimum waiting time. By doing so, service providers can attain customer satisfaction.

Ethiopia is undertaking vast organizational transformation efforts in the public sector to bring about economic development and good governance in the country. To this end, the government has designed package of public service reform programs since 2002. Customer service delivery is one of the sub- programs of public service reform program. The program is designed to improve the quality of services provided by public institutions including the establishment of compliant handling mechanisms.

The public service delivery policy document of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia indicated the prevalent problems that limit the efficiency and effectiveness of the Ethiopian civil service. Some of them are lack of accountability, attitudinal problems, hierarchy of organizational structures, lack of adequate knowledge and skills, lack of transparency, lack of international best practices, etc. This indicates that the implementation of public civil service delivery is tangled with various problems Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE, 2001).

Bole Sub City which is the focus of this study is one of the ten sub cities in Addis Ababa City Administration. Trade and Industry is one of the service providing sectors in the Sub City. Like other sectors in the sub city, different reform tools such as BPR Citizen Charter, and BSC were implemented in the sector to improve service delivery. Moreover, capacity building trainings were given to employees on reform tools so that they can effectively implement the tools.

The public service delivery policy document of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia indicates that the civil service before 1994 was unknown for giving attention for public civil service delivery. That is, the governmental institutions were not in a position to satisfy the needs of their customers. This fact forced the government to design public service delivery policy in 2002.

The implementation of public service delivery in the country has been confronted by different problems that limited its effectiveness. On the other hand, there are potential opportunities that must be exploited in order to succeed in the implementation in order to satisfy the needs of the customers.

Even though service delivery is a widely researched topic around the world, to the best of the researchers' knowledge there are few empirical studies conducted in Ethiopia particularly in civil service institutions of Addis Ababa City Administration The results of these studies revealed that there are several factors that influence the effectiveness of services delivery in civil service institutions. The study conducted by the Ethiopian Civil Service University on the implementation of service standards in Addis Ababa city Administration Trade and Industry sector indicated that the service standards set have not been met (ECSU, 2008). According to Adebabay (2011) the quality of service depends on the quality of employees who provide the service. Another study conducted by Getachew & Common (2006) in two ministries, ministry of Trade and Industry (MOTI), and ministry of Education (MOE) showed that the improvements of service delivery in government institutions occurs when there is commitment, ownership, and the drive for changes. Besides, Kathuri (2014) found out that governance structure as well as the way how work is organized have an effect on the service delivery performance of an organization. However, there are no enough up-to-date empirical studies that attempted to investigate the reason why service standards were not met and ways to improve it in Trade and Industry sector of Bole Sub City. Therefore, the general objective of this study was to assess critical factors that limit service provision and indicate potential opportunities which can help to enhance service delivery in Bole Sub- City Trade and Industry sector. To this end, the study is aimed at addressing the following basic research questions a) What are the major challenges related to Human Resource capacity, system, structure and inputs that limits public service delivery in Bole Sub City Trade and Industry sector? And b) What are the potential opportunities to be exploited to improve service delivery in the sector?

2. Review of Related Literature

2.1 Concepts of Service Delivery

Service has a special character as compared to products. As argued by Chesbrough and Davie (2010), Service can't be inventoried. It is intangible and it has a subsequent consumption when produced and this nature of service leads to the basic demand that service requires close interaction between the provider and the customer (end user). Service has an intangible nature. Organizations involved in service delivery needs to be more vigilant and function proactively to stay competitive in the service sector. According to Grönroos (2001), service has a unique feature which differs from a product. The most important characteristic of service is manifested in its nature that it is a process unlike to a product which can be perceived as a thing and be inventoried.

Service is also characterized by its simultaneous production and consumption which according to Grönroos (2001), service leaves service providers to be engaged in more interactive processes with customers. Discussing about the notion of service, Grönroos (2001) stated that for the service to be produced and delivered to the end user, service providers integrate their most valuable resources like employees, technologies, physical resources, governing systems and customers as well in the best possible way so that service quality can be assured.

Unlike to a product in tangible form, customers of service see and perceive a service from its process point of view and how it is delivered to them and this according to Grönroos (2001), gives service to have a characteristic of process consumption. This clarifies that, service providers strive to satisfy their customers by integrating their resources and systems to make the service provision process as attractive as possible so that their customers will be and stay loyal to them. Goldstein et al (2002) also argued that service is a combination of processes, human

resource skills, materials which needs to be appropriately integrated in order to reach or achieve a planned or designed service.

For service organization or service provider, satisfying or fulfilling the expectation of its customer is one of the major goals. It is stated in the article of Goldstein et al (2002) that for service providers, their main task is to reduce the mismatch or gap between what the organization planned to provide and what the end users (customers) are expecting to benefit from the service they have been offered.

Keltner and Finegold (1996) briefly discussed and explained that customers in the current time are becoming more and more aware of the different service types to be offered. This situation, according to Keltner and Finegold (1996) makes service industries not only concentrate on the reasonable price they ask for the service they provide but also to be more concerned on the quality of service to stay competitive.

It is mostly viewed that in many service provider organizations, a reduction in the price of service is taken as a means to attract customers. But more has to be done than mere price reduction to retain customers and keep them satisfied. Elaborating this idea, Keltner and Finegold (1996) argued that training front line employees and creating integrated service process enhances the quality of service.

Grandey et al. (2005) argued that there is a positive and rewarding response from customers for service providers who have employees with a positive smile during service encounters. Positive impressions are critical and really matter being as a major role for service providers. Organizations should be able to create favorable conditions for positive impressions to be developed during service encounters. Some of the techniques in which organizations can control the display of positive impressions among their employees during service encounters are through training their employees, monitoring and rewards.

Authentic smiles from employees who are representative of their service providing organization help create positive relationship with their customers. And this type of genuine relation between employees and customers can result from skilled impression management.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Design and Methodology

A research design is the program that guides the researchers in the process of collecting, analyzing and interpreting the data. The researcher decided to use the descriptive survey research design to provide solutions to the research problems. Descriptive research involves gathering data that describe events and then organizes, tabulates, depicts, and describes the data collection. This research design is used because it often uses visual aids such as graphs and charts to aid the reader in understanding the data distribution. Because the human mind cannot extract the full import of a large mass of raw data, descriptive statistics are very important in reducing the data to manageable form (Glass & Hopkins, 1984).

3.2 Sources of Data

In this study, the data are collected from two major sources from the selected samples. The first sources were the directors from the selected samples institutions and the second sources were the civil servants working in the selected sample institutions.

3.3 Sample size and Sampling Techniques

Bole Sub City Trade and Industry sector was selected purposively for this case study. The Sub City is one of the ten sub cities in Addis Ababa City Administration. It has a total of 14 weredas. Out of 130 total employees working in the Trade and Industry sector of the sub city 98 employees were randomly selected to fill the questionnaire. The rationale for selecting simple random sampling was aimed to give equal chance for the entire population. Moreover five directors were purposively selected for interview. Moreover, sample size was determined by using Taro Yamane's formula.

$$n= N/1+N (e)^2$$

Where: n= required sample size, N = the population size and e = the margin of error

Thus, in this study the sample size was determined by using this formula

N= 130 employees, e= 5 %,

$n=130/1+130 (0.05)^2 = 98$

Based on the result of the calculation the sample size for a total Population of Bole sub City Trade and Industry employees which were 130 was 98 employees.

3.4 Instruments and Procedures of Data Collection

For this study, primary data gathering instruments particularly questionnaires and structured interviews were used

Questionnaires

This kind of data collection method is most popular and preferred by most researchers due to the fact that it is easy to accommodate and get response in case of big enquires. It consists of questions in structured form or set of forms (Kothari 2004). The researchers designed a set of questionnaires based on the basic research questions and in light of the review of the related literature for Bole sub city Trade and Industry sector employees. The questionnaires were made to include both close-ended and open-ended questions. The closed ended questionnaire was developed using Likert scale format (considered on 1-4 point scale), '1' represents the 'low level of satisfaction', whereas '4' stands for 'high level of satisfaction'. The draft questionnaires were reviewed by colleagues. Based on the comments the researcher improved it. Then, the questionnaires were duplicated and distributed to 98 employees. Completed questionnaires were collected. The return rate was 78 (80%), which met a greater satisfactory level of returns.

Interviews

This kind of data collection method engages presentation of oral –verbal communication and the response is via in the same way (oral-verbal). This method involves personal interview or if it is possible, through telephone interviews (Kothari 2004). The purpose of this interview helps to know what the management's perspective was towards the major challenges of service delivery in the sector. The researcher designed an interview guide to interview five heads heads of wereda Trade and Industry offices.

3.5 Method of Data Analysis

As the researcher explained before, the collection of data and method of analysis are based on descriptive method. Since the analysis is descriptive that provides description of individuals, groups or situations. The quantitative and qualitative data collected from primary data through

questionnaires and interviews were categorized and presented in table forms as per their similarities, then, analysed with the help of data analysis software - Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS V.21) package and put in descriptive statistics like percentage. Depending on the results of the analysis, necessary discussions were made to clarify the issues. Moreover, the data obtained from interviews were analyzed and were used to elaborate the ideas and sometimes to show the difference as a means to triangulate the data obtained by questionnaires. The analyzed data were interpreted by the researcher so as to get meaningful information on the study.

4. Findings and Discussions

4.1 Presentation and Analysis of Data

This part of the study deals with the presentation and analysis of the data collected from the sample respondents to seek appropriate answers for the basic questions raised at the beginning of this study. To this effect, a total of 98 questionnaires were distributed to employees of sample institutions. Out of these, 78 of the employees filled the questionnaire and returned. The rate of return of questionnaire was 80 %. Moreover, interviews were done with five heads of sample institutions. Based on the responses obtained, analysis and interpretation of the data are presented as follows.

Table 4.1: General Profile of Respondents

No.	Questions	Scale	Frequency	%
1	Gender	Male	40	51.3
		Female	38	48.7
		Total	78	100
2	Qualification	< Diploma	3	3.8
		Diploma	19	24.4
		First Degree	56	71.8
		Total	78	100
3	Experience of respondents	1-5 years	38	48.7
		6-10years	15	19.2
		11-15 years	5	6.4
		> 15 years	5	6.4
		Total	78	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

The above table shows that out of the total number of employees, who participated in the study, 40 (51.3 %) respondents were male and 38 (48 %) respondents were female. This shows that there was gender balance in the study.

The data shows that employees below diploma level were 3 which is 3.8 % , with diploma were 19 which is 24.4%, and first degree were 56 which is 71.8% out of the total respondents. This implies that most of the respondents have first degree and implies that their levels of education had significant implication on their responses to the questions posed to them.

With respect to the experience of respondents in the organization, the above data in table 4.1 shows that employees with 1 to 5 years of experience were 38 which is 48.7 %, 6 to 10 years of experience were 15 (19.2 %), 11 to 15 years of experience were 5 (6.4%) and above 15 years of experience were 5 (6.4 %) of the total respondents. This implies that the majority of the respondents have an experience between 1 and 5 years of experience.

Table 4.2: Employees' Capacity (Knowledge, Skill and Attitude)

No.	Questions		Scale				Total
			Very High	High	Medium	Low	
1	Employees have enough Knowledge of to deliver effective service	Frequency	21	32	24	1	78
		%	26.9	40	30.8	1.3	100
2	Employees have skills to implement their plan	Frequency	12	36	26	-	74
		%	16.2	48.6	35.1	-	100
3	Employee possess positive attitude to serve customers	Frequency	15	18	42	4	78
		%	19.2	23.1	52.6	5.6	100
4	Employees understand the organization mission, vision and values	Frequency	22	30	22	3	77
		%	28.6	39	28.6	8	100
5	Leadership support employees in delivering effective customer service	Frequency	11	22	35	8	77
		%	14.3	29.9	45.5	10.4	100
6	The leadership decide on time for issues that needs decision	Frequency	9	,26	34	8	77
		%	11.7	33.8	44.2	10.4	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

Employees response to whether they possess enough knowledge about the service they provide to their customers, the above table shows that 21 (26.9%) of them replied as very high, 32 (40%) of them replied as high, 24 (30.8%) them replied as medium, while 1 (1.3%) of them replied as low level. This data shows that most of the employees which is (66.9%) of them responded as more than high level. This implies that employees possess enough knowledge to deliver quality services to their customers.

Regarding to whether employees possess enough skills for delivering satisfying customer service, 12 (16.5 %) of them responded as very high, 36 (48.6 %) of them responded as high, 26 (35.1%) responded as medium level. The above data shows that most of the employees which were (65.1%) have skills between high and very high levels. This implies that most employees possess the necessary skills to deliver quality service. Moreover, the interview with mangers revealed that employees have skill gaps for service delivery.

With respect to employees attitudes to serve their customers, the above data shows that 15 (19.2%) of them responded as very high, 18 (23.1%) of them responded high, 41 (52.6%) responded medium, while 4 (5.6 %) them responded as low levels. This data shows that almost half of the employees' attitude towards serving their customers is below medium level. It implies that employees attitude have contributed for delivering services below the service standard set by the sector. Moreover, the interview with mangers revealed that there are some employees which lack the right attitude to serve customers.

Whether employees understand the mission, vision and shared values of their organization in delivering customer service, the above data shows that 22 (28.6 %) of them responded as very high, 30 (39 %) of them responded high, 22 (28.6 %) responded medium, while 3 (8%) them responded low level. This indicates that most of the employees in the sector which are beyond medium level understand their organization's mission, vision and shared values.

Regarding the level of the leadership support to employees in delivering effective customer service, the data in the above table show us that 11(14.3 %) of them responded as very high, 22

(29.9 %) of them responded as high, 35 (45.5%) responded as medium, while 8 (10.4%) them responded as low level. About 56 % of the employees responded between medium and levels means that there is some gap in leadership support to employees for delivering efficient and effective services to customers.

Whether decision making were on time by leadership on issues raised by customers during service delivery, the above data shows that 9 (11.7%) of them responded as very high, 26 (33.8 %) of them responded as high, 34 (44.2%) responded medium, while 8 (10.4%) them responded as low level. It indicates that almost half of the respondents replied on this issue between medium and low levels. This implies that there is some limitation on the part of the leadership to decide on time in customer service delivery.

In line with this, the findings of empirical studies as well as theoretical literatures revealed that employees' competencies (knowledge, skill and abilities) have a direct effect on the service delivery performance of an organization (Hanafi, H. M., & Ibrahim, S. B., 2018; Armstrong & Taylor, 2014).

Table 4.3: Organizational System for Service Delivery

No.	Questions		Scale				Total
			Very High	High	Medium	Low	
1	Presence of service standards in the organization	Frequency	20	35	19	1	75
		%	26.7	46.6	25.3	1.3	100
2	Revision of the organization service standards	Frequency	6	9	27	32	74
		%	8.1	12.2	36.5	43.2	100
3	Communicating the organization's service standards to customers by different means	Frequency	16	35	13	11	75
		%	21.3	46.7	17.3	14.7	100
4	There is a system for employees capacity building in the sector	Frequency	5	14	30	28	77
		%	6.5	18.2	39	36.4	100
5	There is a Monitoring and Evaluation system in the sector to improve service delivery	Frequency	5	33	27	11	76
		%	6.6	43.4	35.5	14.5	100
6	There is a system to motivate employees based on their performance	Frequency	3	16	34	25	78
		%	3.8	20.5	43.6	30.1	100
7	There is customers grievance handling System in the organization	Frequency	9	37	26	5	77
		%	11.7	48.1	33.8	6.5	100
8	BSC implemented so as to manage performance in the organization	Frequency	12	34	26	5	77
		%	15.6	44.2	33.8	6.5	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

With respect to the question whether there were service standards or not, the data in the above table show that 20 (26.7%) of them responded as very high, 35 (46.6%) of them responded as high, 19 (25.3%) responded as medium, while 1 (1.3%) them responded as low level. It showed that majority of the employees responded on this issue above medium levels. Most employees revealed the existence of service standards in the sector implies that service standards are there in the sector and they know it as well.

With respect to whether the service delivery standards are continuously improved, the data in the above table show that 6 (8.1%) of them responded as very high, 9 (12.2%) of them responded

as high, 27 (36.5%) responded as medium, while them responded 32(43.2%) as low level. It indicates that majority of the employees which is 79.7 % medium and below medium levels. This implies that service standards were not continuously improved by the sector. Moreover, the interview with leaders revealed that the sector has not been measuring customer satisfaction and continuously improve service delivery process

Employees response to whether standards and requirements of service are known by the customers, 16 (21.3%) of them responded as very high, 35 (46.7%) of them responded as high, 13 (17.3 %) responded as medium, while 11 (14.7 %) them responded as low level. This data shows that majority of the employees which is 68% replied above high level on this issue. It implies that most customers have enough knowledge about service standards and requirements of services set by the sector. However, there are still some customers who didn't know the standards and requirements of the services since 14.1 % of the respondents replied as low level.

The response of employees regarding the existence of a system to build their capacity of delivering quality customer service, the data in the above table show that 5 (6.5 %) of them responded as very high, 14 (18.2 %) of them responded as high, 30 (39%) responded as medium, while 28 (36.4%) them responded as low level. This shows that most of the employees which is 75.4% replied between medium and low levels on this issue. This implies that there is no adequate system for building employees capacity for delivering quality customer service. Moreover, the interviewed leaders strengthen the quantitative data by indicating that there were no appropriate trainings to build employees capacity in the sector.

Employees response with respect to the existence of a monitoring and evaluation system to improve service delivery in the sector, the data in the above table show that 5 (6.6%) of them responded as very high, 33 (43.4%) of them responded as high, 27 (35.5%) responded as medium, while 11 (14.5 %) them responded as low. Most respondents almost half of the respondents replied as there is no monitoring and evaluation system in service delivery. It implies that there is a gap in establishing and implementing monitoring and evaluation system by the sector to improve the service delivery. However, the data collected from interview show the presence of monitoring and evaluation system, but there is a limitation in assessing the system continuously to improve the service delivery process.

Employees response the presence of result based employee motivation system to improve employees performance, the data in the above table shows that 3 of the respondents which is (3.8%) responded as very high, 16 of them which is (20.5 %) of them responded as high, 34 of them which is (43.6 %) responded as medium, while 25 of them which is (30.1 %) them responded as low level. This shows that majority of the respondents which is 73.7 % responded medium and below medium levels. It implies that there is no enough motivation system in the sector to enhance employees' performance so that they can deliver efficient and effective services for customers. Moreover, the interviewed leaders indicated that there is no system to motivate employees based on their performance.

Regarding complaint handling system to issues raised by customers in service delivery, the data in the above table show that 9 of the respondents which is (11.7%) responded as very high, 37 of the respondents which is (48.1 %) responded as high, 26 of the respondents which is (33.8%) responded as medium, while 5 of the respondents which is (6.5%) them responded as low level.

This shows that most of the respondents which is 93 % responded as medium and above medium levels. It implies that there is a system for handling service delivery related complains by customers. Besides the interview data showed that the presence of complaint handling system.

Regarding the implementation BSC in the organization in delivering satisfying services to customers, 12 of the respondents which is (15.6 %) responded as very high, 34 of the respondents which is (44.2 %) responded as high, 26 (33.8%) responded as medium, while 5 of the respondents which is (6.5%) responded as low level. It indicates that majority of the respondents which is 93.6% responded as medium and above medium levels. This refers the implementation BSC in the sector has a contribution for delivering satisfactory service to customers. Moreover, the data collected from interview strengthen the above data in such a way that the sector's balanced scorecard helped in assessing customers' needs during the planning phase.

Table 4.4: Organization Structure for Service Delivery

No	Questions		Scale				Total
			Very High	High	Medium	Low	
1	The organizational structure is favorable for delivering better services to customers	Frequency	6	28	33	9	76
		%	7.8	36.4	42.9	11.7	100
2	The office layout is favorable for delivering better services to customers	Frequency	4	16	29	27	76
		%	5.3	21.1	38.2	35.1	100
3	The Change army (1 to 5 team) helps for delivering better services to customers	Frequency	4	29	34	9	77
		%	5.2	37.7	44.2	11.8	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

Respondents response to whether there is appropriate organizational structure for delivering quality service to customers, the data in the above table indicate that 6 of the respondents which is (7.8 %) responded as very high, 28 of them which is (36.4 %) responded as high, 33 of them which is (42.9%) replied as medium, while 9 (11.7 %) them replied as low level. It indicates that almost half of the respondents replied between lo and medium levels. This implies that there is inconvenience of organizational structure in the sector for service delivering. Besides, the interview data indicate that the organizational structure in the sector especially in wereda Trade and Industry offices are not suitable service delivery.

The respondents' response to whether office alignment is suitable for delivering satisfying service, the data in the above table show that 4 (5.3 %) of them replied as very high, 16 (21.1 %) of them replied as high, 29 (38.2%) of them replied as medium, while 27(35.1%) of them responded as low level. It indicates that most of the respondents which is 73.3 % replied medium and below medium levels. This implies that the office alignment in sector limits delivering satisfying service to their customers. Moreover, the interview with mangers revealed that the office alignment is not suitable for service delivery.

Regarding the contribution of change army (1to5) to deliver satisfying services, 4 (5.2%) of them replied as very high, 29 (37.2%) of them replied as high, 34 (44.2%) of them replied as medium, while 9 of the respondents which is (11.8%) responded as low level.

The above data shows that majority of the respondents which is 81.9 % replied as between high and medium level. This shows that the change army in the sector has some contribution to deliver satisfying service to customers.

In line with this finding, the empirical study conducted by Kathuri (2014) indicated that governance structure as well as the way how work is organized have an impact on the effectiveness of service delivery performance of an organization. Besides, Teixeira et al. (2008) found out that the structure of an organization whether centralized or flat will influence the effectiveness of service delivery

Table 4.5: Process Input for Service Delivery

No.	Questions		Scale				Total
			Very High	High	Medium	Low	
1	There is enough Human and Resource for effective service delivery in the sector	Frequency	8	30	22	18	78
		%	10.3	38.6	28.1	22.8	100
2	There is enough budget for effective service delivery in the sector	Frequency	1	15	34	27	77
		%	1.3	19.5	43.9	35.1	100
3	There is enough office furniture for effective service delivery in the sector	Frequency	1	14	34	27	76
		%	1.3	18.4	44.7	35.5	100
4	There is IT enabler for effective service delivery in the sector	Frequency	1	38	24	14	77
		%	1.3	49.4	31.2	18.2	100
5	There is conducive work environment for effective service delivery in the sector	Frequency	-	13	16	47	76
		%	-	17.1	21.1	61.8	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

Respondents response regarding the availability of enough man power for delivering satisfying customer service, the data in the above table indicate that 8 of the respondents which is 10.3 % of replied as very high, 30 (38.6 %) of them replied as high, 22 (28.1 %) of them replied as medium, while 18 (22.8 %) of them replied as low level. The above data indicates that almost half of the respondents which are 50.9 % replied as medium and low levels. It implies that there is some shortage in manpower in the sector. Moreover, the interview data collected from leaders shows that there is a shortage of manpower and the presence of high employee turnover in the sector. This shows that the data collected from interview is similar with the data collected by questionnaires.

With respect to the availability of enough budget for service delivery, the data in the above table show that 1 of the respondents which is 1.3 % of them replied as very high, 15 of the respondents which is (19.5 %) of them replied as high, 34 of the respondents which is 43.9% replied as medium, while 27 of the respondents which is 35.1 % them replied as low level. This indicates that majority of the respondents which is 79.1 % replied medium and below medium levels. It implies that there is shortage of budget that limits the delivery of satisfying customer service. Moreover, the data from interview with leaders revealed that there is a Shortage of budget for service delivery in the sector.

Regarding whether there is enough office furniture for service delivery, 1 (1.3 %) of them responded as very high, 14 (18.4 %) of the responded as high, 34 (44.7 %) of them responded as medium, while 27 (35.5 %) of them replied as low level. It indicates that majority of the respondents which is 80.2 % replied between medium and low levels. It implies that the shortage of office furniture limit the sector to deliver satisfying service to customers. Moreover, the

interview with managers revealed that there is a shortage of office furniture for service delivery in the sector.

Respondents' response regarding the availability an Information Technology enabler for service delivery, 1 of the respondents (1.3%) of them replied as very high, 38 of the respondents which is (49.4 %) of them replied as high, 24 of the respondents which is (31.2 %) replied as medium, while 14 (18 %) them responded as low level. This indicates that almost half of the respondents replied the unavailability of Information Technology for service delivery. Moreover, the interview data showed that the availability of IT. However, they revealed that interruption of network as a major problem for service delivery.

Regarding the availability of conducive environment for delivering quality service, 13 of them which is (16.7%) of them responded as high, 16 of the respondents which is (20.5 %) replied as medium, while 47 of them which is (60.3%) replied as low level. It shows that most of the respondents which is 60 % replied on this issue as low level. It implies that poor working environment limits quality service delivery in the sector. Moreover, the data from interviewed leaders regarding inputs needed for service delivery, they mention there is a shortage of electric power supply; inconsistent network availability and high employee turnover are the major challenges of service delivery in the sector.

In line with the findings of this study, empirical literatures revealed that the availability of work inputs determine the effectiveness of service delivery. For instance, Mesert (2017) indicated that in addition to employees' competencies (knowledge, Skill and Attitude), appropriate placement, communication and employee motivation, the effectiveness of service delivery performance depends on different work inputs like IT, skilled manpower; budget, resource allocation and conducive work environment.

Table 4.6: Customers Contribution for Service Delivery

No.	Questions		Scale				Total
			Very High	High	Medium	Low	
1	customers fulfill service requirements to get services	Frequency	4	27	33	12	76
		%	5.3	35.5	43.4	15.8	100
2	customers challenge service providers to get quality service	Frequency	9	39	23	5	76
		%	11.8	51.3	30.3	6.6	100

Source: (Survey Data, 2017)

Employees' response to whether customers fulfill the requirements of the service delivery beforehand, the data in the above table 4 (5.3 %) of the respondents replied as very high, 27 (35.5 %) of them replied as high, 33 (43.4 %) of them replied as medium, while 12 (15.8%) of them replied as low. The data shows that about 60 % of the respondents replied between medium and low levels. This implies that most customers do not fulfill service requirements to get efficient services. Moreover, the interview with leaders revealed that the increase in the number of customers from time to time in connection with the expansion of the sub city is one factor for delivering service below set standard.

Employees response to whether customers question their rights for quality service, 9 (11.8 %) of them replied as very high, 39 (51.3 %) of them replied as high, 23 (30.3 %) replied as medium, while 5 (6.6 %) them replied as low level. This data indicates that 90.6 % of the respondents replied medium and above medium levels. It implies that majority of the customers ask their rights to get quality service.

5. Conclusion and Recommendation

5.1 Conclusion

Based on the basic research questions and in line with the preceding research findings and considering the review of related literature, the following conclusions are drawn:

Regarding employees' competencies (Knowledge, Skill and attitude) needed for service delivery; most employees possess the enough knowledge. However, they lack some skills and attitude to deliver efficient and effective service to customers.

Moreover, the leadership support to employees was not at the expected level. Besides, leaders of the sector didn't make timely decisions which make the services to slow.

Even though employees of the sector have enough awareness about the mission, vision, shared values and service standards of the sector, service standards were not well communicated to customers, the standards are not continuously improved and customers' satisfaction has not been measured.

The sector established service delivery compliant handling system. Besides, implementation of reform tools like Balanced Scorecard (BSC) has a contribution for delivering quality services to customers of the sector. However, the sector lacks systems for employees' capacity building, service delivery monitoring and evaluation and employee motivation.

Regarding the structure, the change army in the sector has some contribution for delivering quality service to customers. However, the organizational structure and the office layout of the sector were not found suitable for delivering quality service to customers especially in woreda Trade and Industry offices.

With respect to inputs needed for service delivery, there were shortages of manpower and high employee turnover in the sector. Shortages of budget, Information Technology (IT) and office furniture, inconsistent network availability, interruption of electric power supply and unfavorable working environment were among the major challenges of service delivery in the sector.

It is obvious that customers' fulfillment of service requirements will have positive contributions for providing services based on established service standards. However, some customers of the sector who didn't fulfill service requirements contributed their part for the delays of services and this led to provision of services below standards.

5.2 Recommendation

Based on the major findings of the study, the following recommendations are forwarded.

1. Leadership support to employees in service delivery plays a great role in providing effective service to customer. In this regard, leaders in the sector have to play their roles in supporting employees to facilitate service delivery.
2. To enhance the service delivery in the sector, it needs to establish different policies and procedures for human resource development, employee motivation and monitoring and evaluation.
3. It is known that organizational structure and other team based structures have a important roles in delivering quality service to customers. Thus, the office alignments in the sector need to be reorganized in such a way that facilitates the service delivery process.
4. Communicating the service standards and the requirements to customers through different means like citizen charter is important for the attainment of service standards.

Besides, the sector need to continuously measure customer satisfaction and improve the service standards set to meet the present and future demands of customers. Moreover, the customers' knowledge gap regarding the standards and the requirements of the services need be filled or at least minimized by further communication through different means.

5. It is obvious that service delivery is facilitated through different inputs such as human resource, budget and other resources like office furniture. Moreover, supporting the service delivery through Information Technology (IT) and creating conducive organizational environment will enhance its process. In this regards, the sector needs to alleviate the shortage of manpower, budget, office furniture, high employee turnover and poor organizational environment for service delivery in the sector.

References

Adebabay Abay. (2011). Promoting and Strengthening Professionalism in the Civil Service: The Ethiopian Case. Capacity Building Workshop on Promoting Professionalism in the Public Service: Strengthening the Role of Human Resource Managers for the Effective Implementation of the Charter for Public Service in Africa, March 14–18, Addis Ababa.

Armstrong, M., & Taylor, S. (2014). Armstrong's handbook of human resource management practice. Kogan Page Publishers.

Belete Negesso (2006). Business Process Reengineering: concepts, techniques, tools and implementing guideline (manual), training and coaching material, Ministry of Capacity Building, (unpublished), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Chesbrough H. and Davies A. (2010); Advancing Service Innovation: Five Key Concepts. In J. Sphorer (Ed). The hand book of service science- a research perspective, springer Verlag.

Ethiopian Civil Service University (2008). Public Service Delivery: unpublished handout, Addis Ababa.

Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2001). Service delivery policy in the civil service, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Getachew Hailemariam & Common, R. (2006). Civil service reform in Ethiopia: Success in two ministries. *Research Memorandum, 59*.

Glass, G. V., & Hopkins, K. D. (1984). Inferences about the difference between means. *In Statistical Methods in Education and Psychology* (pp. 230-232). Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ.

Goldstein, S., et.al (2002). The service concept: the missing link in service design research, Journal of operations management, vol. 20.

Grandey, A., Fisk, G., Mattila, A., Jansen, K. & Sideman, L. (2005). Is "service with a smile" enough? Authenticity of positive displays during service encounters; *Organizational behavior and human decision processes,* vol. 96.

Grönroos, C. (2001).The perceived service quality concept - a mistake? Managing service quality, Vol.11 no.3.

Hammer, M., & Champy, J. (1993). Reengeneering the corporation.

Hanafi, H. M., & Ibrahim, S. B. (2018). Impact of employee skills on service performance. *International Journal of Science and Research.(IJSR)*, *7*(12), 587-598.

Kathuri, W. (2014). Effects of Organizational Systems on Service Delivery in Civil Organizations in Marsabit County (Doctoral dissertation, United States International University-Africa).

Keltner, B. & Finegold, D. (Fall 1996). Adding value in banking: Human resource innovations in service firms, MIT Sloan management review, and vol. 38 no.1.

Kothari C.R (2004), Research methodology, methods and techniques (2nd revised edition): New Age International (P) Ltd.

Milakovich M. (1995) Improving Service Quality: achieving high performance in the public and private sectors, CRC press LLC, USA

Paulos, Chane. (2001). The challenges of the civil service reform in Ethiopia: Initial observations. *East Africa Social Science Research Review*, *XVII*, 79–102.

Teixeira, R., Koufteros, X., Peng, X. and Schroeder, R. (2008). "The relationship between organizational structure and integration: the effects on manufacturing performance", paper presented at 39th Decision Science Annual Meeting, Baltimore, MD.

Yamane, T. (1967). Statistics, An introductory Analysis, 2nd Ed.,New York: Harper and Row.
1.